Name: Muhammad Tayyab

Roll No: F23-1118

Semester: 6th (B)

Subject: English Jurisprudence-II

Submitted to: *Ma'am Amina Anam*

Assignment

Probative Value of Evidence in Jurisprudence

1. Introduction

In the field of Jurisprudence and Law of Evidence, the concept of *probative value* plays a central role in determining the outcome of legal disputes. Courts rely on evidence to establish facts, and not all evidence carries equal weight. The strength or persuasive power of evidence is referred to as its **probative value**.

Probative value is crucial because it ensures that judicial decisions are based on reliable, relevant, and logically convincing material rather than speculation or prejudice. This assignment explores the meaning, importance, types, governing principles, and legal provisions related to probative value.

2. Meaning and Definition of Probative Value

The term "probative" is derived from the Latin word *probare*, meaning "to prove." Thus, **probative value refers to the ability of a piece of evidence to prove something material in a case**.

Definition

Probative value can be defined as:

The extent to which evidence tends to establish the truth of a fact in issue.

In simpler terms, it answers the question:
How strongly does this evidence support a particular claim?

3. Importance of Probative Value

Probative value is essential for the proper administration of justice. Its importance includes:

a. Ensuring Fair Trials

Courts must rely on evidence that genuinely contributes to truth-finding. High probative value ensures fairness.

b. Filtering Weak Evidence

Evidence with little or no probative value may be excluded to avoid misleading the court.

c. Judicial Decision-Making

Judges weigh evidence based on its probative strength before reaching conclusions.

d. Preventing Prejudice

Sometimes evidence may be emotionally powerful but logically weak. Courts balance probative value against prejudicial effect.

4. Types of Evidence and Their Probative Value

Different kinds of evidence carry different levels of probative value:

a. Direct Evidence

- Directly proves a fact (e.g., eyewitness testimony).
- Usually has high probative value if credible.

b. Circumstantial Evidence

- Indirectly proves a fact through inference.
- Can be highly probative when forming a complete chain.

c. Documentary Evidence

- Written or recorded material.

- Often highly reliable if authentic.

d. Real (Physical) Evidence

- Tangible objects (e.g., weapons, fingerprints).
- Strong probative value due to physical presence.

e. Expert Evidence

- Provided by specialists (e.g., doctors, forensic experts).
- Probative value depends on expertise and methodology.

5. Factors Affecting Probative Value

The probative value of evidence is not fixed; it depends on several factors:

a. Relevance

Evidence must relate to a fact in issue. Irrelevant evidence has no probative value.

b. Reliability

Evidence must be trustworthy. For example, unreliable witnesses reduce probative strength.

c. Credibility

The honesty and consistency of the source affect value.

d. Corroboration

Evidence supported by other evidence gains higher probative value.

e. Authenticity

Especially important for documents and digital evidence.

f. Chain of Custody

In criminal cases, improper handling reduces evidentiary value.

6. Probative Value vs. Admissibility

A key distinction in evidence law:

Aspect	Probative Value	Admissibility
Meaning	Weight of evidence	Whether evidence can be presented
Focus	Persuasiveness	Legal acceptance
Decision-maker	Judge (or jury)	Judge

Evidence may be **admissible but have low probative value**, or vice versa.

7. Legal Provisions (Focus on Pakistan / Common Law System)

In Pakistan, the law governing evidence is primarily the:

Qanun-e-Shahadat Order, 1984

Key provisions related to probative value include:

a. Article 2 – Definitions

Defines evidence and its scope.

b. Articles 17–19 – Relevancy of Facts

- Only relevant facts are admissible.
- Relevance directly impacts probative value.

c. Article 59 – Opinion of Experts

- Expert opinions are relevant.
- Probative value depends on expertise.

d. Articles 71–73 – Documentary Evidence

- Governs primary and secondary evidence.
- Authentic documents carry higher probative value.

e. Article 117 – Burden of Proof

- The party asserting a fact must prove it.
- Strong probative evidence is required to discharge this burden.

8. Probative Value in Criminal vs Civil Cases

a. Criminal Cases

- Standard: **Beyond reasonable doubt**
- Evidence must have very high probative value.

b. Civil Cases

- Standard: **Balance of probabilities**
- Lesser probative strength may suffice.

9. Judicial Approach to Probative Value

Courts evaluate evidence through:

a. Logical Analysis

Judges assess whether evidence logically supports a conclusion.

b. Comparative Weighing

Different pieces of evidence are compared.

c. Exclusion of Prejudicial Evidence

Evidence with low probative value but high emotional impact may be excluded.

10. Leading Principles and Doctrines

a. Best Evidence Rule

- The original evidence should be presented.
- Enhances probative value.

b. Hearsay Rule

- Statements made outside court are generally inadmissible.
- Low probative value due to lack of cross-examination.

c. Res Gestae

- Facts forming part of the same transaction are relevant.
- Often carry strong probative value.

11. Challenges in Assessing Probative Value

- Human error in judging credibility
- False or fabricated evidence
- Technological complexities (digital evidence)
- Bias and prejudice

12. Modern Developments

With technological advancements:

a. Digital Evidence

- Emails, CCTV, and metadata are increasingly used.
- Requires authentication.

b. Forensic Science

- DNA evidence has very high probative value.

c. Artificial Intelligence

- Emerging role in evidence analysis (still developing).

13. Conclusion

Probative value is the backbone of the law of evidence. It ensures that only meaningful, reliable, and persuasive evidence influences judicial decisions. While admissibility determines whether evidence enters the courtroom, probative value determines its impact on the outcome.

A proper understanding of probative value helps maintain fairness, accuracy, and integrity in legal proceedings. Courts must carefully balance relevance, reliability, and fairness to ensure justice is served.

References

- M. Mahmood, *Qanun-e-Shahadat Order*
- Cross & Tapper on Evidence
- Phipson on Evidence
- Relevant case law from Pakistani courts